

Exhibit I

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF MONTANA

BILLINGS DIVISION

TRACY CAEKAERT, and
CAMILLIA Mapely,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

Case No. CV-20-52-BLG-SPW

WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND
TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK,
INC., and WATCH TOWER BIBLE
AND TRACT SOCIETY OF
PENNSYLVANIA.

Defendants,

)

Expert Videotaped Deposition

In Person/Zoom Videoconference

Bradley Lovett

August 11, 2023

Reported By: Gidgette Nieves, CSR No. 10142
WORDS COURT REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
(844) 289-WORD(9673)
www.WordsCourtReporting.com

09:50:46 1 different than an elder or is that the same?

09:50:49 2 A Well, we didn't have elders at the time.
09:50:52 3 And they needed to fill these slots. And -- you'll
09:51:00 4 notice even my mother was put in there.

09:51:04 5 Q And that's not typical is it to have a
09:51:07 6 female on here as a servant or an elder or
09:51:11 7 anything?

09:51:11 8 A At that time -- it wasn't typical but it
09:51:14 9 wasn't uncommon.

09:51:16 10 Q Okay. How many approximately people were
09:51:19 11 at the -- in the new Hardin congregation in 1971, if
09:51:23 12 you remember?

09:51:25 13 A Maybe -- maybe 30, 35. I'm just
09:51:30 14 guessing.

09:51:33 15 Q And this -- this document we're looking at
09:51:36 16 Exhibit 1, it looks like it came from the Watch
09:51:40 17 Tower Society in New York?

09:51:42 18 A Yes.

09:51:43 19 Q Looks like the Watch Tower Society is
09:51:45 20 saying that -- I'll read it. Their pleased to
09:51:50 21 advise that the servant appointments to the
09:51:54 22 positions below have been made.

09:51:56 23 Did you understand that the Watch Tower
09:52:00 24 Society had approved these -- these specific
09:52:02 25 appointments?

09:52:03 1 A Well, when the letter came back that

09:52:05 2 was --

09:52:05 3 Q That's what this letter is saying?

09:52:07 4 A Uh-huh.

09:52:08 5 Q The Watch Tower Society approved these
09:52:12 6 appointments, correct?

09:52:13 7 A Uh-huh, yeah.

09:52:14 8 Q Okay. And again, I'm sorry, I don't know
09:52:18 9 if you answered that question. About how many
09:52:19 10 people were in the congregation at that time?

09:52:22 11 A 30, maybe 35.

09:52:24 12 Q How did you go about finding these
09:52:26 13 people?

09:52:27 14 A We -- we contacted them in the -- either
09:52:32 15 in our house-to-house ministry and some had known in
09:52:39 16 some other areas they -- they -- and they wanted
09:52:41 17 to -- to attend so they had moved to Hardin and they
09:52:48 18 began attending once we had a -- a meeting plan.

09:52:55 19 Q Okay. If you look at the bottom of this
09:53:01 20 document, sir --

09:53:02 21 A Uh-huh.

09:53:03 22 Q -- in the fine print down there it states
09:53:06 23 that "Please see that the newly appointed servant
09:53:10 24 becomes thoroughly familiar with his duties as they
09:53:14 25 are set forth in the book. Your world is a Lamp to

09:53:17 1 my foot, comma, and then the Kingdom ministry." Do
09:53:22 2 you see that, sir?

09:53:23 3 A Yeah, uh-huh.

09:53:26 4 Q And are those books that you would -- the
09:53:28 5 congregation would get from the Watch Tower
09:53:31 6 Society?

09:53:31 7 A Yes.

09:53:32 8 Q And you understood from this letter that
09:53:33 9 the servants in this congregation, the new servants
09:53:38 10 needed to become familiar with the duties that are
09:53:40 11 set forth in those books?

09:53:42 12 A Yes.

09:53:42 13 Q Okay. That's part of the job of being a
09:53:45 14 servant in a new congregation?

09:53:50 15 A Yeah.

09:53:57 16 Q Do you recall when the first elders were
09:54:00 17 appointed on this new congregation?

09:54:04 18 A Probably. I think the arrangement came in
09:54:06 19 about '71, I think.

09:54:08 20 Q Who were the original elders?

09:54:14 21 A I can't remember. Martin Svenson I think
09:54:21 22 was one. Harold Rimby. And they put me down even
09:54:27 23 though I think I been baptized six months or
09:54:32 24 something at the time. I'm trying to think if there
09:54:39 25 were others. I can't remember.

1 BY MR. SHAFFER:

2 Q Is this a document -- or have you ever
3 seen a document like this before?

4 A Uh-huh.

5 Q What kind of document is this? What is
6 this?

7 A It's -- I forget the -- the number on it.
8 But it was where they put the
9 recommendations for elder's ministerial service.

10 Q Okay. When you say "they put the
11 recommendation," you mean the circuit overseer would
12 do that?

13 A The local congregation along with the
14 circuit overseer.

15 Q Okay. And then if we flip to the second
16 page of Exhibit 3, I'm going to direct you to --
17 let's go back to the first page. Just one second.
18 The stamp up here in the upper left-hand corner
19 duplicate copy to "society for return after
20 approval"?

21 MR. MCCABE: There's no stamp on this
22 copy.

23 BY MR. SHAFFER:

24 Q Do you see where it says "duplicate copy
25 to Society for return after approval." Do you see

10:21:11 1 that, Mr. Lovett?

10:21:13 2 A Yes.

10:21:13 3 Q And is that referring to the copy that
10:21:15 4 would go to New York that would get stamped either
10:21:18 5 approving or not approving the elders and then come
10:21:22 6 back to the congregation?

10:21:23 7 A Yeah.

10:21:24 8 Q And if we flip to the next page, same
10:21:32 9 corner there, upper left-hand corner. "Governing
10:21:37 10 body has approved the recommendations on the reverse
10:21:40 11 side as indicated by the Watch Tower Society stamp,"
10:21:42 12 below; do you see that, Mr. Lovett?

10:21:44 13 A Yes.

10:21:45 14 Q And then there's the Stamp Watch Tower
10:21:47 15 Bible and Tract Society New York?

10:21:48 16 A Yes.

10:21:50 17 Q SCL, May 7th, 1984. You see that?

10:21:53 18 A Yes.

10:21:53 19 Q Is that the Watch Tower Society then
10:21:56 20 approving the appointment of those elders on the
10:21:57 21 previous page?

10:21:58 22 A Yes.

10:21:59 23 Q Okay. Is that how the process worked in
10:22:01 24 the 70s as you understood it?

10:22:04 25 A As I recall, Uh-huh.

10:22:05 1 Q Okay. Do you know what SCL stands for?

10:22:11 2 A Yeah, I'm not sure. I guess it's just a

10:22:15 3 designation.

10:22:17 4 Q All right.

10:22:18 5 A I want to say Southern California but it

10:22:22 6 doesn't. It's in Montana.

10:22:23 7 Q All right. Let's go back to Document

10:22:26 8 number?

10:22:26 9 A Is this the one you --

10:23:23 10 Q Okay. I'm going to flip this to a page.

10:23:25 11 Sorry, this is going to be a little tedious for

10:23:28 12 awhile this morning, just flipping through this

10:23:29 13 document. But we'll get through it.

10:23:53 14 James, we're missing some pages on this

10:23:55 15 one. We are just going to use mine for number two.

10:24:30 16 All right. We'll stick this one. So we're looking

10:24:33 17 at Caekaert/Mapely 1872 on the bottom right.

10:24:39 18 Paragraph 58. Can you read -- are you able to read

10:24:42 19 that paragraph 58. I don't want you to read the

10:24:45 20 whole thing. But I just want to know if you can

10:24:47 21 read it in general.

10:24:48 22 A Yeah.

10:24:49 23 Q That says recommendations for new

10:24:50 24 appointments or deletions. It says, that they're

10:24:51 25 made on the S2 form when the circuit overseer visits

1 the congregation. Is that the process we were just
2 talking about for the appointment of elders?

3 A Yes.

4 Q Okay. Says the S2 form is then sent to
5 the Society along with another Form S303 form.
6 Shows the appointments for elders or deletions. And
7 then it says: The branch committee must decide
8 whether or not to approve the recommendations by the
9 elders and by the circuit overseer. Is that the
10 process -- the same process we've talked about this
11 morning for appointing elders?

12 A Yes. It appears to be.

13 Q All right. Did you under -- was there any
14 other way to be appointed as an elder in the
15 1970s -- let's talk about the late 70s then, after
16 77?

17 A I don't know. I don't know all of
18 their -- I know that way. But I -- I don't know if
19 there were other --

20 Q Are you aware -- aware of any another
21 method to be appointed as an elder?

22 A Not actually. There was no -- this was
23 the only routine that you went through.

24 Q Okay. Can we agree then that the only way
25 to be appointed an elder during this time period

10:26:21 1 would be if the Watch Tower Society approved it?

10:26:25 2 A I don't know.

10:26:26 3 MR. TAYLOR: Listen to the question.

10:26:26 4 MR. SHAFFER: Sorry, we couldn't hear you,
10:26:26 5 Joel.

10:26:36 6 We couldn't hear you.

10:26:36 7 MR. TAYLOR: I didn't understand which
10:26:39 8 defendant he was referring to. He just said, "Watch
10:26:42 9 Tower Society" so I just objected for the record.

10:26:46 10 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:26:46 11 Q Okay. Are you aware of any other way that
10:26:49 12 an elder can be appointed other than by approval of
10:26:52 13 the Watch Tower Society?

10:26:53 14 A I'm just -- I'm not aware. There may be
10:26:54 15 other -- other ways or whatever, but I don't know.
10:26:55 16 I'm not -- I'm just a little --

10:26:57 17 Q Yeah. This is the only method you're
10:27:00 18 aware of.

10:27:01 19 A Yes, that I'm aware of. That I used when
10:27:04 20 I was there, yes.

10:27:04 21 Q You can't appoint yourself as an elder,
10:27:08 22 right?

10:27:09 23 A I assume.

10:27:10 24 Q Okay. Have you ever seen -- have you ever
10:27:13 25 seen anybody appointed as an elder that wasn't

10:27:17 1 approved by the Watch Tower Society?

10:27:20 2 A No.

10:27:22 3 MR. TAYLOR: Again, my objection to the
10:27:23 4 form of the question.

10:27:25 5 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:27:25 6 Q Mr. Lovett do you understand the
10:27:27 7 question?

10:27:27 8 A Uh-huh, yes.

10:27:28 9 Q Are you aware of anybody ever being
10:27:30 10 appointed an elder to a congregation that was not
10:27:34 11 approved by the Watch Tower Society?

10:27:36 12 A I -- I don't know. I'm --

10:27:37 13 Q You don't know whether you're aware of
10:27:38 14 it?

10:27:39 15 A If there is another method, I have no
10:27:42 16 idea.

10:27:42 17 Q Okay. So the only method you're aware of
10:27:45 18 is when the Watch Tower Society approves it?

10:27:48 19 MR. TAYLOR: Again, objection to the form
10:27:49 20 of the question.

10:27:54 21 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:27:54 22 Q Yes or no?

10:27:57 23 A They've always handled it this way, that's
10:27:59 24 it.

10:28:01 25 Q Okay. All right. You become an elder in

10:28:06 1 1971 in Hardin. Tell me how you learn to do your
10:28:10 2 job as an elder?

10:28:14 3 A From what we see in the publications.

10:28:21 4 Q Let's talk about that for a second. Which
10:28:25 5 publications are we talking about?

10:28:28 6 A Actually anything pertinent, I guess.

10:28:33 7 Q Kingdom ministry school coursebook?

10:28:36 8 A That could be, Uh-huh, yes.

10:28:39 9 Q Okay. And would that be a book that would
10:28:41 10 be at a, like an elder training convention?

10:28:47 11 A Yeah.

10:28:47 12 Q Okay. And who would put on those
10:28:49 13 conventions, those elder training conventions?

10:28:53 14 A The -- we say the branch though we didn't
10:28:55 15 -- the -- yeah, Watch Tower put them on through the
10:29:00 16 branch arrangement.

10:29:02 17 Q In your mind during this period of time
10:29:04 18 was there a difference between the branch and the
10:29:07 19 Watch Tower?

10:29:08 20 A Well in my own mind I just -- we just
10:29:11 21 refer to it in general. We always just -- if they
10:29:14 22 say the Society or whatever.

10:29:17 23 Q They'd say the Society?

10:29:19 24 A Well, we would amongst ourselves. No,
10:29:22 25 they've -- they've approved this recommendation or

1 whatever. We just -- that was pretty common.

2 Q And that's what the literature would say,
3 right, the literature would say with the Society,
4 wouldn't it, the publications?

5 MR. TAYLOR: Again Objection to the
6 form.

7 THE WITNESS: What would -- yeah, what
8 would you have in mind? What were you -- what were
9 you thinking?

10 BY MR. SHAFFER:

11 Q Well, I want to know what you were
12 thinking. How did you come to refer to as the
13 Society? I mean you saw that somewhere, right?

14 A Well, it -- it was printed by them.
15 Whatever it was printed we'd say well, we got that
16 from the Society.

17 Q Okay. And did you understand the Society
18 was different from the branch office?

19 A They are somewhat different in the sense
20 that -- but we -- we just generally referred to it
21 as -- as the Society. We wrote a letter to the
22 Society and it would be to the branch actually. But
23 we just --

24 Q Okay. All right. We were talking about
25 how you learned to do your job as an elder. We

1 talked about the publication. You mentioned
2 publications. I mentioned the Kingdom Ministry
3 coursebook. And then we talked about that would be
4 introduced to the elders at a -- like an elder
5 training convention.

6 A It could be. They did it a number of
7 different ways.

8 Q And as a circuit overseer you've attended
9 and instructed elders at a Kingdom School Ministry
10 course, haven't you?

11 A Yes.

12 Q And that's -- is that a meeting where
13 you'll meet with elders and you'll have literature
14 from the Watch Tower Society with you that you go
15 through kind of on a schedule with the elders to
16 instruct them how to do their job. Is that a fair
17 description?

18 A Well, a lot of that changed over the years
19 too. And I'm trying to think back on the various
20 methods or approaches. But there would be -- our
21 schools we would have that would deal with certain
22 aspects of -- of the arrangement. They didn't --
23 they didn't comprehensively do everything all at
24 once, they just -- and that's where you would learn
25 certain things. But all of those things can be

1 abridge by letters or -- or other publications that
2 might come out later.

3 Q So everything in the Kingdom school
4 ministry course could be abridged by a letter that
5 would come from the Watch Tower Society or other
6 publications; is that fair?

7 A Or some direction, you know, specifically
8 dealing with -- with that subject.

9 Q Okay. Do you know who James Roland is?

10 A Yes.

11 Q He's been deposed. And he said when he
12 was appointed as an elder he went to a training
13 course for elders in Billings.

14 A Uh-huh.

15 Q And he described going through the Kingdom
16 school ministry course.

17 A Uh-huh.

18 Q Does that ring a bell to you having an
19 elder training in Billings at any point in time
20 or?

21 A We never did in -- in Billings.

22 Q Where did you do them? Where did the
23 Hardin congregations elders have their Kingdom
24 school ministry course?

25 A I don't know. I was gone.

10:32:28 1 Q Okay. But in the period of let's say the
10:32:35 2 late 1970s at least through the mid '80s were elders
10:32:41 3 trained at a Kingdom school ministry course with a
10:32:46 4 document called the Kingdom school ministry
10:32:49 5 course?

10:32:51 6 A I don't -- it was pretty much related to a
10:32:59 7 particular subject; whatever it might happen to be.
10:33:02 8 There's -- I mean you could -- you could spend
10:33:05 9 months on -- on some of that.

10:33:06 10 Q But sure. Let's not -- I don't want to
10:33:08 11 get into the particulars of what was being trained
10:33:12 12 and taught or instructed. But just in general as a
10:33:15 13 concept isn't that how elders would learn to do
10:33:18 14 their job in the late 70s to mid 80s, they'd go to a
10:33:21 15 Kingdom school ministry course with publications
10:33:23 16 from the Watch Tower Society?

10:33:24 17 A Most --

10:33:25 18 MR. TAYLOR: Again objection to the form
10:33:26 19 of the question.

10:33:28 20 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:33:28 21 Q You can answer. It's okay.

10:33:30 22 A Most of the time. What my -- what I was
10:33:35 23 trying to say a minute ago -- what was your
10:33:37 24 question?

10:33:39 25 Q As a general concept late 1970s to the mid

10:33:43 1 '80s, elders would be trained on how to do their job
10:33:47 2 and what the expectations were from the Watch Tower
10:33:50 3 Society by going through the Kingdom Ministry course
10:33:54 4 publication at a -- at a convention or a training;
10:33:57 5 is that right?

10:33:58 6 A We had those schools.

10:34:00 7 Q Okay.

10:34:00 8 A And I'm just saying it from my own
10:34:03 9 standpoint in our last meeting.

10:34:04 10 VIDEOGRAPHER: Let's -- let's look at
10:34:05 11 Document Number 4. This gentleman will help you.
10:34:18 12 Thank you, sir.

10:34:36 13 MR. SHAFFER: All right. Exhibit 4 is the
10:34:37 14 Kingdom school MINISTRY course.

10:34:42 15 (Exhibit 4 marked for identification.)

10:34:42 16 MR. MCCABE: It's actually called the
10:34:44 17 "Kingdom Ministry School Course."

10:34:47 18 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:34:47 19 Q Kingdom Ministry School. "Compiled and
10:34:50 20 published by the Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society
10:34:53 21 of Pennsylvania, 1972."

10:35:02 22 Have you seen -- no this is just a copy of
10:35:05 23 it. Have you seen this publication in book form
10:35:12 24 before?

10:35:14 25 A I -- I don't recall. They -- there used

10:35:18 1 to be a book I believe that was, you know, bound and
10:35:24 2 that they used in these courses.

10:35:29 3 Q Okay.

10:35:29 4 A And it was -- it was abridge at this time
10:35:32 5 went on and even the materials were done. They
10:35:34 6 would -- not everybody went to the same school,
10:35:40 7 taught the same thing. They --

10:35:46 8 Q Let's flip to the next page. Thank you,
10:35:54 9 sir.

10:35:55 10 All right. The first few words here "The
10:35:57 11 Kingdom Ministry School course has been arranged by
10:35:59 12 the Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society to help
10:36:04 13 overseers become equipped to shepherd the flock of
10:36:07 14 God. The school was dedicated to Jehovah God and
10:36:12 15 the advancement of Kingdom interest." What does
10:36:15 16 that mean to you?

10:36:15 17 A Better do a job. Is that what you mean?

10:36:19 18 Q Okay. And when it says "Watch Tower Bible
10:36:21 19 and Tract Society" in that first paragraph, what
10:36:24 20 does that mean to you? Does that mean a particular
10:36:26 21 corporation or is just a society like we've talked
10:36:30 22 about?

10:36:31 23 A Just a society in general and most all of
10:36:33 24 it.

10:36:34 25 Q Is it fair to say that elders are expected

10:36:37 1 to kind of know what's in this document, the Kingdom
10:36:41 2 Ministry School course?

10:36:43 3 A Well, as many as -- as they will attend
10:36:48 4 it. But like I say, they're usually in a
10:36:53 5 different -- a different times and they may have
10:36:56 6 added material or subtracted material depending on
10:37:00 7 the circumstance. I'd say generally that's --
10:37:05 8 that's true.

10:37:06 9 Q It's true in general that elders are
10:37:08 10 expected to know the material in this document; is
10:37:10 11 that fair?

10:37:11 12 A Yeah, they are instructed about it.

10:37:16 13 Q Who are the instructors at a Kingdom
10:37:19 14 Ministry school course?

10:37:22 15 A Generally it's local circuit overseer,
10:37:26 16 generally at that time.

10:37:28 17 Q Okay. And who decides what materials
10:37:30 18 comes to the course?

10:37:33 19 A The branch -- it's -- it's -- it's
10:37:36 20 printed, you know, they make that decision. And
10:37:39 21 then how it's taught we might have a lot of
10:37:45 22 discretion as to what we would do if we were
10:37:50 23 teaching something like that. How you present it.

10:37:54 24 Q Okay. I think what you're saying is the
10:37:56 25 branch would provide the circuit overseer the

10:41:25 1 Q Branch Organization?

10:41:27 2 A Yeah, we never -- we didn't follow -- we
10:41:30 3 weren't involved with that. It may be things from
10:41:33 4 it, may be repeated in other places. But none of
10:41:37 5 those were ever handed out to anybody that I know
10:41:40 6 of.

10:41:41 7 Q How about a circuit overseer. Did you
10:41:43 8 ever see that document, the Branch organization
10:41:50 9 Manual?

10:41:51 10 A No, we didn't get any of that.

10:41:54 11 Q Okay. Do you know who used that book, the
10:41:57 12 Branch Organization Manual?

10:42:00 13 A No.

10:42:03 14 Q Okay. I think we're probably done with
10:42:05 15 Exhibit 2 then.

10:42:39 16 MR. SHAFFER: Let's look at Tab 5, mark
10:42:43 17 Exhibit 5.

10:42:44 18 (Exhibit 5 marked for identification.)

10:42:44 19 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:42:44 20 Q All right. This is a book I've mentioned
10:42:47 21 "Pay Attention to Yourself and all the Flock." Flip
10:42:51 22 to the third page. There you go. It says "Kingdom
10:43:01 23 Ministry School Textbook." Do you see that, Mr.
10:43:06 24 Lovett?

10:43:07 25 A Yes.

10:43:07 1 Q Is that in reference to the fact that this
10:43:10 2 is a sort of a book you have in an elder ministry
10:43:14 3 school?

10:43:15 4 A Yes.

10:43:16 5 Q Okay, in general. And go to the next
10:43:19 6 page. It says "Published by Watch Tower Bible and
10:43:23 7 Tract Society. This one is of New York, September
10:43:26 8 1977. I assume the fact that this one is from New
10:43:35 9 York and the previous one was published and
10:43:37 10 distributed by Watch Tower Bible and Tract Society
10:43:41 11 Pennsylvania. I -- I assume that didn't effect your
10:43:44 12 job at all as a circuit overseer teaching this
10:43:47 13 stuff, did it?

10:43:48 14 A I don't -- no, I don't believe so.

10:43:55 15 Q All right. So if we can look at this
10:43:59 16 page. You got there. Thank you. Bate's number
10:44:00 17 229, this is WTNY229. The top there's "To the
10:44:08 18 student." Who would the student be in this
10:44:12 19 course?

10:44:13 20 A Probably the elders I would think.

10:44:15 21 Q Okay. Pay Attention to Yourselves and All
10:44:18 22 the Flock is a continuation of the Kingdom of
10:44:23 23 Ministry school course. So it looks like this is
10:44:26 24 kind of an addition to, and you've kind of mentioned
10:44:29 25 this, this morning. You have abridgements or

10:44:31 1 additions to the Kingdom of School -- Kingdom

10:44:34 2 Ministry School coursebook. This would be one of

10:44:37 3 those -- looks like this would be one of those

10:44:40 4 additions to it; is that right?

10:44:42 5 A I don't know as you would say it's an
10:44:44 6 addition, but it would explain many things that have
10:44:49 7 already been taught or they would go back and deal
10:44:52 8 with that.

10:44:52 9 Q Okay. Is this a document, sir, that you
10:45:02 10 became familiar with as an elder and a circuit
10:45:05 11 overseer?

10:45:06 12 A Well you tried, uh-huh.

10:45:08 13 Q Okay. That's what the Watch Tower Society
10:45:11 14 wanted you to do, correct?

10:45:15 15 A Yes.

10:45:39 16 MR. SHAFFER: Okay. Number 6. Document
10:45:40 17 number 6.

10:45:43 18 (Exhibit Number 6 marked for identification.)

10:45:43 19 BY MR. SHAFFER:

10:45:43 20 Q Again, bottom right corner on the cover
10:45:45 21 page, Kingdom Ministry School Textbook, and it says
10:45:48 22 KS81. The next page Published by Watch Tower Bible
10:45:53 23 and Tract Society of New York. This one is 1981. I
10:46:04 24 forgot to mention that. This one starts -- if you
10:46:09 25 look at the table of content, sir, Bate's document

11:01:05 1 the flock book, and you had a question about it.

11:01:08 2 What it meant, how to apply it, how to instruct it,

11:01:11 3 what would you do? Who would you call?

11:01:15 4 A Well, they would generally have you put it
11:01:17 5 in writing. But --

11:01:19 6 Q You say they?

11:01:21 7 A I would call the -- what we call the
11:01:25 8 branch now. But who was handling the work in the
11:01:32 9 United States.

11:01:33 10 Q Okay. So either write to the branch or
11:01:35 11 call somebody at the branch with a question?

11:01:38 12 A Uh-huh.

11:01:38 13 Q That was a yes?

11:01:40 14 A Yes.

11:01:46 15 Q And did you understand -- let's again go
11:01:48 16 back to your first period of time as an elder. Did
11:01:53 17 you understand that you could be removed from your
11:01:57 18 position?

11:01:58 19 A Yes.

11:01:58 20 Q Did you ever see that happen? Did you
11:02:00 21 ever see an elder removed?

11:02:02 22 A Yes.

11:02:03 23 Q And what was the reason that you saw
11:02:05 24 elders removed from their positions?

11:02:08 25 A Just a whole variety of -- of reasons.

11:02:13 1 If they -- then -- you know, for an
11:02:19 2 extended period of time they didn't come to the
11:02:22 3 meetings, they didn't participate in -- in the field
11:02:26 4 that, that type of thing. And it goes wrong, they
11:02:30 5 would of course they would be removed.

11:02:33 6 Q Okay. Failure to perform the duties of an
11:02:37 7 elder would that be a reason to be removed or
11:02:42 8 deleted as an elder?

11:02:44 9 A Yes. It depends on what -- what duties, I
11:02:46 10 guess too. Cause sometimes they couldn't help it.
11:02:47 11 They had some other reason, but they were not able
11:02:49 12 to share or participate.

11:02:51 13 Q And if an elder is deleted does that
11:02:54 14 follow kind of the process we talked about for the
11:02:58 15 appointment whereby there's that S2 form that has
11:03:01 16 appointments and deletions?

11:03:03 17 A Uh-huh.

11:03:03 18 Q If it's a deletion the elder's name would
11:03:06 19 be put in the column for the deletion that would be
11:03:08 20 sent to the branch office, right?

11:03:11 21 A Uh-huh.

11:03:11 22 Q That's a yes?

11:03:13 23 A With an explanation. What -- what the
11:03:15 24 situation was.

11:03:16 25 Q And the branch officer review it, and if

11:03:19 1 the branch office approved it, you'd get the
11:03:22 2 stamp?

11:03:22 3 A Come back just like you saw.

11:03:24 4 Q It would come back to the congregation?

11:03:27 5 A Yeah.

11:03:28 6 Q Okay. Branch office kept a copy of that
11:03:31 7 document as far as you know?

11:03:33 8 A As far as I know. And I don't, you know,
11:03:38 9 I don't know what they do with a lot of that. But
11:03:41 10 as far as I know.

11:03:44 11 Q You have not seen their files, I take
11:03:47 12 it?

11:03:47 13 A No.

11:03:48 14 Q Fair enough. Tell me about your files.
11:03:50 15 Did you keep files as an -- as an elder?

11:03:54 16 A Yes.

11:03:55 17 Q How would you keep those documents?

11:03:58 18 A Well, you just make a copy of whatever
11:04:00 19 reports you were sending in.

11:04:02 20 Q Okay. And would you keep hard copies?
11:04:07 21 Back in the '70s and '80s, would you keep the hard
11:04:10 22 copies?

11:04:11 23 A Yes.

11:04:11 24 Q Is there a file cabinet in the
11:04:14 25 congregation? Did you keep it at your house? How

1 specifically. The elders would write about some
2 specifics and everything else and send that into the
3 Society.

4 Q And you said at some point in time
5 specific procedures for handling child sex abuse
6 came down from the branch of the Society, right?

7 A Yeah. Well, you -- yes, you'd see it.

8 Q Do you know why that was. Do you know why
9 specific procedures were handed down for child sex
10 abuse?

11 A Well I would assume to kind of standardize
12 it and give them some good guidance on what to do.
13 I don't know the first time it ever came up. There
14 was many of them. And it really wasn't established.
15 But we -- we couldn't find a lot on it. But we knew
16 that it was wicked and wrong. And you'd act on it
17 if you could and you'd use the scriptures you had.
18 And usually they were -- they were sufficient at
19 that time.

20 Q And you're talking the time before
21 specific procedures were handed out?

22 A Yeah. In the, oh, the 70s these things
23 kind of come out. As needed, they come out in these
24 letters. But usually it was to address a
25 specific.

12:35:24 1 Q Sure. That's part of the role of the
12:35:27 2 elder, isn't it, to check in on the flock like
12:35:29 3 that?

12:35:30 4 A Uh-huh.

12:35:31 5 Q That's a yes?

12:35:32 6 A Without -- yeah, without overdoing it and
12:35:36 7 just giving your best answer off the top of your
12:35:39 8 head. You want to have some basis for whatever you
12:35:45 9 -- you're saying, if at all possible.

12:35:48 10 MR. MCCABE: Excuse me. I'm just going to
12:35:50 11 stick my head out and ask for more air. I think
12:36:16 12 we're going to die in here pretty soon.

12:36:16 13 MR. SHAFFER: Sure.

12:36:16 14 MR. SWEENEY: The air conditioning works
12:36:19 15 pretty well in here.

12:36:19 16 MR. SHAFFER: Yeah, if we have AC that's
12:36:19 17 fine.

12:36:19 18 BY MR. SHAFFER:

12:36:19 19 Q And tell me as an elder what do you
12:36:21 20 have -- if someone comes to you and you're talking
12:36:23 21 to that person about their problem, you're maybe
12:36:27 22 reading some scripture to them. I assume it's
12:36:31 23 pretty important to keep that stuff confidential?

12:36:34 24 A Yes.

12:36:35 25 Q Okay. Do you tell anybody about it? Do

14:06:59 1 Q No. The reporting. I think we're talking
14:07:01 2 about the reporting now?

14:07:02 3 A Oh, the reporting. I'm not sure when that
14:07:06 4 took place.

14:07:07 5 Q Okay.

14:07:08 6 A But I know it came up and maybe it was one
14:07:11 7 of our schools or something.

14:07:13 8 Q All right. Are you aware that, I'm sure
14:07:16 9 you are, that Jehovah's Witness church has a
14:07:22 10 confidentiality policy?

14:07:23 11 A Uh-huh.

14:07:24 12 Q Comes from scripture?

14:07:27 13 A Huh.

14:07:27 14 Q Is that right?

14:07:28 15 A Yes. I don't know what you -- what you
14:07:30 16 mean as far as -- as far as that goes.

14:07:33 17 Q You don't talk about --

14:07:34 18 A Explain it to me.

14:07:35 19 Q Yeah. You don't talk about things that
14:07:37 20 you've learned about other people, right?

14:07:40 21 A True.

14:07:41 22 Q That's important?

14:07:42 23 A Pardon.

14:07:43 24 Q That's important to not talk about things
14:07:46 25 you've learned about other people, you agree?

14:07:48 1 A That's true.

14:07:49 2 Q And that's a policy that comes right from
14:07:51 3 scripture?

14:07:52 4 A Yes. You're not gossiping about them or
14:07:55 5 telling things that are untrue.

14:08:10 6 Q Has that been the policy ever since you've
14:08:14 7 been a part of the church?

14:08:17 8 MR. MCCABE: What policy, I'm sorry?

14:08:19 9 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:08:19 10 Q Confidentiality policy of not talking
14:08:22 11 about what you learn about other people?

14:08:23 12 MR. TAYLOR: Just object to the form
14:08:24 13 of term -- form of the question, and the term
14:08:25 14 "policy." If it's a principle found in the Bible,
14:08:29 15 they might follow it.

14:08:31 16 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:08:31 17 Q Has that been the same throughout your
14:08:34 18 experience in Jehovah's Witness church,
14:08:36 19 Mr. Lovett?

14:08:38 20 A Yes.

14:08:45 21 Q Okay. And like any sin I assume that's --
14:08:47 22 you have to answer to God if you were to violate
14:08:49 23 that policy, that rule, that scripture --

14:08:53 24 A Uh-huh.

14:08:53 25 Q -- is that fair?

14:08:55 1 A Up to us to make -- to retain
14:09:00 2 confidentiality.

14:09:01 3 Q And if you don't do that you have to
14:09:02 4 answer to got at some point in time; is that fair?

14:09:05 5 A Well, he would be aware of what -- what
14:09:09 6 you've done if you've done that sort of thing and
14:09:12 7 that's all.

14:09:13 8 Q And so if you've learned that a person has
14:09:16 9 been sexually abused or that a person has sexually
14:09:20 10 abused a young girl, let's put it that way. You've
14:09:22 11 learned that a member sexually abused a young girl,
14:09:25 12 you've got an obligation to keep that confidential,
14:09:28 13 what that person has done?

14:09:30 14 MR. TAYLOR: Objection to the form of the
14:09:32 15 question. Poses an incomplete hypothetical for
14:09:35 16 which this individual has already said he's never
14:09:38 17 participated in any type of hearing about that.

14:09:40 18 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:09:40 19 Q Talking about the application of the
14:09:42 20 confidentiality policy that you said has been the
14:09:44 21 same throughout your --

14:09:47 22 A Well, we've always been talking to keep it
14:09:49 23 confident, and we don't discuss it with anyone.

14:09:53 24 Q So someone -- you learned that somebody
14:09:54 25 steals a car, a member of the church steals a car.

14:09:58 1 You have an obligation to keep that confidential,
14:10:01 2 right?

14:10:02 3 A Yes --

14:10:04 4 MR. TAYLOR: Objection. Objection again
14:10:04 5 to the form of the question. If he learns of this
14:10:07 6 communication in a confidential setting in a
14:10:10 7 judicial committee, he might have certain
14:10:13 8 obligations. If he observed someone as a witness
14:10:16 9 stealing a car, just as a particular person, he
14:10:19 10 might have different obligations. The hypothetical
14:10:23 11 is incomplete.

14:10:26 12 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:10:26 13 Q You learned that so and so steals a car in
14:10:29 14 your role as an elder, you're not supposed to gossip
14:10:33 15 about that, are you?

14:10:35 16 A No.

14:10:35 17 MR. MCCABE: Objection as to the
14:10:37 18 incomplete hypothetical. So and so member of the
14:10:41 19 congregation or are they just a passerby?

14:10:44 20 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:10:44 21 Q Okay. You learn that a member of the
14:10:46 22 congregation hurts his wife, physical abuse, you're
14:10:50 23 not supposed to gossip about that, are you?

14:10:54 24 A Well, depending on the situation. We
14:10:56 25 would take it to the elders and depending on how

14:11:01 1 extreme it was and whatever sometimes it's -- these
14:11:06 2 are misunderstanding or it's not a judicial
14:11:10 3 matter.

14:11:11 4 Q So the elders might discuss it amongst
14:11:14 5 themselves?

14:11:16 6 A Well on these issues where you're trying
14:11:18 7 to form a committee or trying to help them in some
14:11:22 8 way that would, they can do that, they can discuss
14:11:23 9 it, but they have to keep it among themselves.

14:11:27 10 Q The elders do?

14:11:28 11 A Yeah. They can't spread it around.

14:11:31 12 Q And so the elders would be held to that
14:11:34 13 confidentiality policy on that subject matter?

14:11:39 14 A Yes, yes.

14:11:52 15 Q Same rule applies to -- let's say you
14:11:55 16 learned that again as your time as an elder you
14:11:59 17 learned that somebody sexually abused a young girl,
14:12:02 18 a member of the congregation has abused a young
14:12:06 19 girl, confidentiality policy would require you to
14:12:10 20 keep that confidential, correct?

14:12:12 21 MR. MCCABE: Objection; incomplete
14:12:15 22 hypothetical; asked and answered.

14:12:17 23 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:12:17 24 Q You can share it with other elders if you
14:12:20 25 learn that a -- let's say you learned that an elder

14:12:22 1 has sexually abused a girl in the congregation. Who
14:12:28 2 could you share that information without violating
14:12:29 3 the confidentiality policy?

14:12:33 4 A The elders themselves would -- would hear
14:12:36 5 of it and do it and then try to determine the
14:12:36 6 legitimacy. And then if they need to form a
14:12:40 7 committee that's fine. If they need to tell the
14:12:44 8 officials, they -- they have to do that too.

14:12:46 9 Q If sharing outside of the elders, that
14:12:48 10 would be prohibited by the confidentiality policy,
14:12:53 11 correct?

14:12:55 12 MR. MCCABE: Objection; incomplete
14:12:58 13 hypothetical. Vague as to time.

14:12:59 14 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:12:59 15 Q Go ahead. You can answer.

14:13:00 16 The elders themselves can discuss it but
14:13:02 17 they couldn't share it outside the group of elders,
14:13:05 18 correct?

14:13:05 19 MR. MCCABE: Objection; same objection;
14:13:07 20 it's an incomplete hypothetical; it's vague as to
14:13:10 21 time.

14:13:13 22 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:13:13 23 Q Go ahead, Mr. Lovett.

14:13:14 24 A I'm just trying to calculate this. But
14:13:19 25 normally we don't talk to anyone outside. Let's

1 say, you do -- it becomes a judicial matter, you
2 don't tell even the other -- the other elders. It's
3 kept between yourself --

4 Q Right.

5 A -- and the other -- other two guys.

6 Q And you certainly wouldn't tell the other
7 publishers in the congregation?

8 A No.

9 Q And so you wouldn't tell the rest of the
10 congregation that maybe there's an admitted child
11 molester in the congregation, would you?

12 MR. MCCABE: Objection; incomplete
13 hypothetical; it's vague as to time. You're asking
14 him to speculate. He's never dealt with such a
15 thing.

16 BY MR. SHAFFER:

17 Q Go ahead, Mr. Lovett.

18 A Ditto. There's -- as I've said, I have
19 not dealt with anything with that in particular.

20 Q Right. I'm asking you to apply the
21 confidentiality policy just like you said. You said
22 even -- even served elders in a congregation
23 wouldn't know what the results of a judicial
24 committee was, correct?

25 A Yeah. Well, it isn't even that. The --

14:14:29 1 when it's reported, then the brothers would try to
14:14:34 2 determine how serious it was, especially on a matter
14:14:37 3 like that. And -- and then they form their
14:14:43 4 committee. But you don't go talking about it --

14:14:46 5 Q Right.

14:14:47 6 A -- with anybody. And of course you inform
14:14:50 7 the Society. And then you -- they'll determine if
14:14:55 8 they're going to be able to do anything about it or
14:14:58 9 if there's enough evidence, that sort of thing.

14:15:01 10 Q You were talking about, and this is your
14:15:03 11 testimony, is that if there's a committee that's
14:15:05 12 form and they come to a conclusion about something
14:15:07 13 or a member confesses to a committee about an act of
14:15:12 14 wrongdoing, I think your testimony is that only --
14:15:14 15 only the elders in that committee would know about
14:15:17 16 that, correct?

14:15:18 17 A Uh-huh, that's correct.

14:15:19 18 MR. MCCABE: Objection; incomplete
14:15:22 19 hypothetical; and misstate his testimony.

14:15:23 20 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:15:23 21 Q Did I misstate your testimony at all, Mr.
14:15:26 22 Lovett?

14:15:27 23 A Run it back.

14:15:27 24 Q Yeah. There's a judicial committee forum
14:15:28 25 that determines somebody acted wrong. Only the

14:15:31 1 elders in that committee would know about that,
14:15:33 2 correct?

14:15:34 3 A That's the -- that-- that's the normal
14:15:37 4 procedure.

14:15:37 5 Q Okay. Nobody else would --

14:15:38 6 A I'm just acting from my own experience
14:15:40 7 from what I've seen.

14:15:41 8 Q I understand, that's all I'm asking. All
14:15:43 9 I want you to do is give me your testimony based on
14:15:45 10 your experience. Which is like 30 years as a
14:15:49 11 circuit overseer, correct?

14:15:52 12 A Yes.

14:15:53 13 Q All right. Are you -- as a circuit
14:15:58 14 overseer are you an elder -- or excuse me. Are you
14:16:02 15 a member of the clergy?

14:16:04 16 A No.

14:16:04 17 Q Do they consider circuit overseers
14:16:08 18 elders?

14:16:08 19 A Yes.

14:16:09 20 Q So you've been an elder, your an elder
14:16:12 21 today?

14:16:13 22 A Yes.

14:16:14 23 Q All right. That's all I'm asking. Is
14:16:20 24 your experience based as an elder -- as an elder
14:16:23 25 for, and then I might be wrong here, over 40 years

14:16:27 1 is that right?

14:16:28 2 A Yeah, an elder, yeah.

14:16:30 3 Q All right. That's a lot of experience as
14:16:32 4 an elder in the Jehovah's Witness church, isn't
14:16:37 5 it?

14:16:37 6 A Well it is. There are so many of these
14:16:41 7 things you don't deal with on a regular basis and
14:16:45 8 sometimes never.

14:16:47 9 Q Confidentiality you deal with that
14:16:48 10 probably quite often?

14:16:51 11 A Uh-huh. Yes.

14:17:15 12 Q In your 40 or 50 years as an elder, are
14:17:19 13 you ever aware of a situation where a judicial
14:17:22 14 committee comes to a conclusion that someone has
14:17:26 15 committed a wrong and that that was announced -- the
14:17:29 16 specifics of what that person did was announced to
14:17:33 17 the congregation?

14:17:35 18 A No. I'm thinking. I can't recall anyone
14:17:44 19 ever getting explicit.

14:17:46 20 Q It's usually pretty vague. Like so and so
14:17:50 21 didn't take care of his family appropriately. Or
14:17:53 22 got too acquainted with a -- with a young girl, or
14:17:57 23 something like that, right?

14:17:58 24 A You don't -- you don't use that
14:17:59 25 description either. They've been reproved or

14:18:04 1 something like that, but you don't get into
14:18:06 2 details.

14:18:07 3 Q Okay. The details are confidential,
14:18:10 4 right?

14:18:12 5 A Suppose to be, yeah.

14:18:15 6 MR. SHAFFER: Okay. I think I'm almost
14:18:18 7 done so let's take five minutes.

14:18:23 8 VIDEOGRAPHER: We're now going off the
14:18:24 9 record. The time is 2:18 p.m.

14:39:18 10 (Recess taken.)

14:39:18 11 VIDEOGRAPHER: We are now going back on
14:39:20 12 the record. The time is 2:39 p.m.

14:39:25 13 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:39:25 14 Q Mr. Lovett, we've talked a little bit
14:39:28 15 about situations that can result in a judicial
14:39:31 16 committee about a confession --

14:39:48 17 MR. TAYLOR: Is it possible to turn the
14:39:48 18 Zoom video back on?

14:39:48 19 COURT REPORTER: Oh, I thought I did.

14:39:48 20 All right. Here you go.

14:39:48 21 MR. TAYLOR: Thank you kindly.

14:39:48 22 BY MR. SHAFFER:

14:39:48 23 Q Confession is one circumstance where a
14:39:50 24 judicial committee would be formed, two or more
14:39:53 25 witnesses, correct?